



SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION - REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
 Tuesday, January 21, 2020 Palm Springs City Hall, Large Conference Room

CALL TO ORDER: Chair Clark called the meeting to order at **5:00** p.m.

ROLL CALL: A quorum was present for this Regular Meeting of the City of Palm Springs Sustainability Commission.

AGENDA APPROVAL: The agenda was presented by Chair Clark. A motion to approve was made by Commissioner Flanagan and seconded by Commissioner Freedman and unanimously carried by an open vote.

	This Meeting	Present to Date	FY 2019/2020 Excused Absences	FY 2019/2020 Unexcused Absences
Roy Clark, Chair	X	41		
Robert McCann, Vice Chair	X	39		
David Freedman	X	51		
Jennifer Futterman	E	35	3	
Greg Gauthier	X	31	1	
John Goins	E	25	3	
Carl Baker	E	17	2	
Jim Flanagan	X	10	1	
Lani Miller	L	10		
Sandra Garratt	X	6		

X = Present E = Excused (notified Chair and Staff of absence)
 L = Late U = did not notify of absence

CITY STAFF PRESENT: Patrick Tallarico, Manager, Office of Sustainability; Daniel DeGarmo, Program Coordinator; Gary Calhoun, Recycling Coordinator

CITY MANAGER / STAFF COMMENTS – Manager Tallarico reported on the following:

- At the December 19, 2019, Council meeting, there was a recap of the Michele Mician Community Garden naming ceremony and a first reading of the 2019 Building Code. Council had no comments.
- On January 19, 2020, the Building Codes were presented as a Public Hearing item, and there were no comments from the public (other than from Commissioner Freedman). The Building Code passed with no further comments. Also, the Council requested that all Boards and Commission meetings begin no earlier than 5:30 PM. This request will be discussed at a future Council meeting.
- Chair Clark reported that at the January 19th Council meeting, all Council liaisons were disbanded and that two Ad Hoc committees will be formed to look at recruiting and interviewing for Commission openings and how the Council interacts with the boards and commissions.
- At the upcoming January 30, 2020 Council meeting there will be a presentation on DCE (Desert Community Energy). Letters to the public will be mailed in February explaining the program.
- The Airport Turf Conversion project will be presented to Council for approval. The RFP that was issued received one response.
- A Staff Report has been prepared to repeal the old solar policy as the new policy has been adopted.
- The Climate Action roadmap is going forward to Council at a future Council meeting.
- The Community Garden Naming Ceremony was well attended. Michele Mician’s mother and brother were present.
- A Greenhouse Gas Inventory will be incorporated into the General Plan update, which is currently underway. Sustainability will provide additional funds to the current contractor to cover work that is outside their current scope.
- The Green Citizen Award is being revived for this year. Applications have been distributed. The award will be presented on Earth Day. A student award will also be presented.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

1. Pete Hodges, Palm Springs, requested that “Natural Resources” be a part of the Mission Statement; that we should focus on sustaining the environment before we focus on sustaining economic growth; that a timetable be added to the Climate Action roadmap; and that bicyclists be given a protected cross light at intersections.
2. Richard Noble, Palm Springs, Climate Reality Project, spoke on the need to move forward more quickly with actions to address climate change and to move to all renewable energy.

B. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

C. PRESENTATIONS

1. Environmental Film Series at the Palm Springs Cultural Center / Camelot Theatre – Megan Goehring Ms Goehring, Manager of the Certified Farmers Markets of the Coachella Valley, also curates the Sustainable Film Series. She provided information on the film series and promotional materials that can be used to advertise the series. She gave a short synopsis of the five films and the pre-movie events. The films will be on January 30, February 27, March 19, April 22 (Earth Day), and May 21.

D. MEETING MINUTES

December 17, 2019 Regular Meeting minutes approval: Motion by Commissioner Flanagan to accept as presented, second by Commissioner Garratt. Motion passed unanimously.

E. RECYCLING REPORT, Recycling Coordinator Gary Calhoun reported on the following:

- Mr. Calhoun spoke with Andrew Smyth from CalRecycle regarding CRV numbers reported for Palm Springs. Mr. Smyth will send a form for us to complete to get those numbers on a regular basis.
- The Beverage Grant application period is open now, and he will work on submitting this on behalf of the City.
- The shredding and e-waste event Saturday, January 18, 2020 brought in about 227 residents.
- Mr. Calhoun picked up batteries and used toner cartridges from Police and Fire Departments and sent them off for recycling.
- Desert Arc collects about 40 tons a month in cardboard alone from the City yard.
- No new legislation to report on.
- In support of AB341, 94 businesses have been visited to discuss their compliance requirements. Mr. Calhoun plans to continue these visits.

Chair Clark mentioned that he heard of a recycling event this weekend to benefit US Kids Chamber of Commerce. Mr. Calhoun will check out the company to make sure they are legally able to have the event.

F. OLD BUSINESS

Commissioners discussed the following items.

1. Single-use Plastics Ordinance:

Manager Tallarico reviewed the changes to the ordinance as a result of Commission input and review by the City Attorney’s office. A meeting was held with the City Manager and Councilmember Holstege to discuss next steps. They requested that the draft be presented at a Study Session with Council to elicit Council input and input from residents and businesses.

Commissioner Garratt stated that many hotels are on board in getting rid of small toiletry bottles in favor of reusable and refillable bottles.

2. Leaf Blower Ban Enforcement Enhancements:

Manager Tallarico has worked with the City Attorney’s office to make changes to the fine amounts and to hold residents and businesses that employ violators to be held accountable as discussed with the Commission previously. The changes will go forward to Council. He also stated that now that Code Enforcement is fully staffed, many more citations have been issued. He is also in contact with the Citizens on Patrol to see if they may be able to issue citations. This increase in enforcement efforts may prompt additional changes in behavior.

Manager Tallarico stated that he met with a landscaper that has been issued citations that the reason he is using a gas blower is that his electric blower was in the shop. Manager Tallarico will follow up with Yoshi's Lawnmower Shop where the blower was taken for repairs.

3. EV Charging Locations:

The City received some feedback from SCE regarding some of the planned charger locations. Manager Tallarico is in the process of setting up a meeting with Charge Point to discuss the implementation of our plan to install additional chargers. A staff report is being developed to send to Council.

Manager Tallarico also showed a map showing the new locations and which ones will be fee based and which ones will be free to use. Completion of the project is scheduled for March 2020.

4. "Flushable" Wipes

Commissioner Miller provided some additional information on the efforts by California Association of Sanitation Agencies (CASA) and National Stewardship Action Council (NSAC) to promote legislation (California AB1672) to address the proper labeling of "flushable" wipes. The International Water Services Flushability Group has developed flushability standards and a label that could be placed on packaging that would be certified as "flushable."

Commissioner Miller proposed that the Commission support NSACE by becoming a member at the \$1000 level. Discussion by the Commissioners led to the following motion:

MOTION: "That the Sustainability Commission recommends the City of Palm Springs become a member of the National Stewardship Action Council (NSAC) in the amount of \$1000.00". Motion by Commissioner Miller and seconded by Commissioner Freedman. Motion passed unanimously in an open vote.

Commissioner Freedman suggested sending a letter of support from the City Council also. Chair Clark asked Commissioner Freedman to draft a letter and staff report to present to Council. Commissioner Freedman agreed to do this in coordination with Commissioner Miller.

G. NEW BUSINESS

1. ONE-PS Annual Picnic, March 23 – "MOTION: The Sustainability Commission approves sponsorship of the ONE-PS Picnic, \$500"

Chair Clark recused himself from the discussion and vote of this item as he is a voting member of the ONE-PS board. Vice Chair McCann conducted the meeting for this item and asked if a Commissioner would make the above motion. Commissioner Freedman made the motion with a second by Commissioner Miller. Commissioner Freedman requested that the Commission coordinate with DCE and Lift to Rise in order to be placed next to each other. Motion passed unanimously.

H. SUBCOMMITTEE AND COMMISSIONER REPORTS

1. Standing Subcommittee on Solar and Green Building –

- a. Building code update: Commissioner Freedman reported that the City Council passed the Building Code on January 9, 2020. The residential solar mandate became law with the passage of the Building Code. A resolution to repeal the previous solar policy will go to City Council soon.
- b. Potential GHG Reduction Measures: Commissioner Freedman reported that he has researched what other cities are doing as part of their efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Several cities have submitted proposed energy efficiency measures to the State Energy Commission, and those proposals are in the process of being approved. Stakeholders have opposed some of these proposed measures, leading to law suits in some cases. Commissioner Freedman has prepared a draft ordinance that would require buildings over a certain size and cannabis facilities to use carbon-

free energy. Businesses could do this easily by staying in the 100% Carbon Free Plan from Desert Community Energy. Manager Tallarico requested that the Subcommittee research the cost impact of the proposed ordinance at its next meeting. This information will be important for the Commission to consider when an official motion comes to the floor.

2. Standing Subcommittee on Waste Reduction.
 - a. Cultural Center project: Manager Tallarico reported that the Center has purchased some recycling containers based on recommendations provided to them. They are also purchasing a bottle filler that will be placed on their existing water fountain.
 - b. Signage update: Manager Tallarico reported that he has located some “dirtier” graphics for the downtown trash container signage, and he will share the graphics with the Subcommittee. They can then be incorporated into the signage if approved.
 - c. Desert Learning Center Evaluation: Vice Chair McCann reported that students did their second data collection to determine a recycling rate baseline, and another is scheduled for Wednesday January 22nd. The study has turned into a more targeted study as the collection shows that there is very little recyclable material being put in the containers. It is mostly food waste.
 - d. Neighborhood Challenge with ONE-PS: Manager Tallarico reported that a meeting with ONE-PS representatives will be held to discuss how a neighborhood challenge could be implemented.
 - e. Potential GHG Reduction Measures – Methane From Water Treatment Operations: Commissioner Miller reported on the process that the WWTP goes through to process waste and the amount of methane gas emissions that are released during that process, and particularly from the flare. She also commented on food waste being a major component of GHG emissions. Commissioner Miller stated that newer technology may now be available that would allow the WWTP’s to sell recovered methane gas to energy companies.
3. Standing Subcommittee on World Environment Day – Commissioner Gauthier stated that a meeting of the Subcommittee will be scheduled next week. He also asked if a budget has been approved for this year’s event. No budget has been approved yet. Commissioner Barratt stated that she has been in contact with Greta Thurnberg’s associates, and there has not been a definite “no” answer yet. They suggested some other more local persons in the US who may also be available. She is also attempting to get Lily Tomlin and Jane Fonda to attend.
4. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Earth Day – Commissioner Baker was not present at this meeting. Manager Tallarico stated no further report.
5. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Walkability & Pedestrian Planning – No report. Chair Clark stated that the Pedestrian Master Plan and Safe Routes to School plan is still waiting on a consultant to be appointed.
6. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Crosswalks and Pedestrian Safety – Chair Clark stated the status on this committee is the same as Walkability & Pedestrian Planning. The suggested crosswalk improvements will be addressed as part of the Pedestrian Master Plan process.
7. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Bicycle Routes and Cycling – No report. Manager Tallarico stated that the updated information for the Bike Map has been given to the consultant for processing.
8. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Night Sky –Vice Chair McCann reported that he has researched the current City code on outdoor lighting to see how far it goes to preserve dark skies and how it compares to other documents including a standard lighting ordinance published by the International Dark Sky Association and the City of Tucson’s Dark Sky ordinance. A conclusion is that the City’s ordinance does not go far enough to shield lighting from going up into the sky. Curfews on when the lights can stay on is one possible compromise.
9. Big Horn Sheep Habitat Protection – Commissioner Flanagan stated that the Volunteer Trail Ranger program is moving along, and the volunteers would like to have Code Enforcement participate with them in the future. He also showed a video that was made by a local teacher. As the end result of this group has been met, this group will now be disbanded and taken off future agendas.
10. Water Conservation – Commissioner Freedman reported the DWA board discussed the Airport Turf Conversion project and that the project is moving forward. There was a 17.4% water reduction in November from the 2013 baseline, with 19.7% cumulative savings for the year and 17.3% since June 2016 when targets were established.
11. Wellness – No report.

12. Desert Community Energy, Community Advisory Committee – Commissioner Freedman stated that the Board met and approved the rates at carbon-free at about 10% above the current SCE rate. The Board also agreed to move forward with a net energy metering program for solar customers towards the end of May 2020. He also stated that at the Community Advisory Committee meeting, Mayor Kors requested additional input from the committee members representing Palm Springs including obtaining input from additional persons who live in Palm Springs. The DCE staff will be working with the current members of the Community Advisory Committee on how to increase Palm Springs participation in the Committee. Commissioner Freedman also reported that he received an update from Hector Sanchez Perez of Lift to Rise on the utility discount program. The program has gone live and brochures are available to describe the program.

I. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND UPCOMING AGENDA DEVELOPMENT –

- Commissioner Flanagan asked if there were any updates on interview for the vacant spot on the Commission. Chair Clark stated that there are no updates.
- Commissioner Garratt mentioned that the City of Malibu has banned the use of Roundup weed killer and that Palm Springs should look into doing the same. Manager Tallarico suggested that this issue will be added to a future agenda.
- Commissioner Freedman stated that State Legislation AB1236 requires that there be an expedited permitting process for installing EV charging stations. Cities less than 200,000 must have an ordinance in place for this. He agreed to work with City staff on the development of the ordinance.

- J. ADJOURNMENT** - The meeting of the Sustainability Commission adjourned at 7:25 PM by a motion from Vice Chair McCann and seconded by Commissioner Flanagan and approved by a unanimous vote. They adjourned to the Regular Meeting of the Sustainability Commission to be held at 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, February 18, 2020, in the Large Conference Room at the Palm Springs City Hall. The Sustainability Commission's regular meeting schedule is at 5:00 p.m. the third Tuesday each month except August unless otherwise noted or amended. Please note that the meeting start times may move to 5:30 pending a decision by City Council at its January 30th meeting.

Respectfully Submitted,

Patrick Tallarico, Manager, Office of Sustainability